



YOUTH AND THE CRIMINAL JUSTICE SYSTEM

Professor Janet E. Mosher
Sept. 1990

Notice: These materials are distributed solely for classroom use by students of the Faculties of Social Work and Law, University of Toronto.

Special thanks to Cathy Taylor for all of her assistance in preparing these materials and to Professor Nicholas Bala and Professor Don Stuart for their kind permission to include portions from their text, Canadian Children's Law: A Coursebook.

Sept 1990

KE -
9779
M67
1990

LAW LIBRARY

OCT 18 1990

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

FACULTY OF LAW LIBRARY
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

YOUTH AND THE CRIMINAL
JUSTICE SYSTEM

Professor Janet E. Mosher
Sept. 1990

Notice: These materials are distributed solely for classroom use by students of the Faculties of Social Work and Law, University of Toronto.

Special thanks to Cathy Taylor for all of her assistance in preparing these materials and to Professor Nicholas Bala and Professor Don Stuart for their kind permission to include portions from their text, Canadian Children's Law: A Coursebook.

Sept 1990



Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

<https://archive.org/details/youthcriminaljus00mosh>

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
<u>PART 1</u>	
<u>THE JUVENILE JUSTICE REGIME</u>	
Chapter One: Legal Responses to Juvenile Crime	1
A) An Overview	1
Bala, "The Young Offenders Act: Why a New Era in Juvenile Justice?"	1
B) Historical Underpinnings	11
(i) The Concept of "Childhood"	11
Empey, <u>American Delinquency: Its Meaning and Construction</u>	11
(ii) The Juvenile Court	22
Fox, "The Treatment of Juveniles in Canadian Criminal Law"	22
(iii) Gestures of Humanity or of Social Control?	28
<u>Re Gault</u>	28
Platt, <u>The Child Savers</u>	30
Empey, <u>American Delinquency: Its Meaning and Construction</u>	35
C) Growing Disillusionment with the J.D.A.	37
(i) The Treatment Debate	37
L.C. Wilson, "Parens Patriae: The Unfulfilled Promise"	37
"Unfortunately there is such a thing as a bad boy"	38
J. Wilson, <u>Thinking About Crime</u>	40
Conly, "A Critique of the Institutional Response to Juvenile Delinquency"	48
Leschied, "Evaluating Conflicts Between Intention and Outcome"	51
Farrington, "Implications of Longitudinal Studies For Social Prevention"	62
"Safety of cities linked to troubled, poor youth"	66
"Fighting the Failure Syndromes"	67
MacKillop and Clarke, "Safer Tomorrows Begin Today"	68
"Frequent spankings cited as cause of delinquency"	77
>New wave of teen gangs preys on subways, schools and stores"	78
"Unloved teens join street gangs"	81
(ii) The Due Process Debate	82
Catton, "Models of Procedure and the Juvenile Courts"	82
Fox, "The Treatment of Juveniles in Canadian Law"	88
<u>Re Gault</u>	89
Corrado and Markwart, "The Prices of Rights and Responsibilities"	91
Greenspan, "The Dilemma of Due Process"	103
(iii) Children's Rights	104
Chisholm, "Towards A Position on Children's Rights"	104
Minow, "Rights for the Next Generation: A Feminist Approach to Children's Rights"	109
Draft Convention on the Rights of the Child	121

Chapter Two: Jurisdiction Based on Age	123
A) Upper Age Limit	124
(i) Provincial Concerns	125
(ii) Provincial Responses	128
Ontario Social Development Council	128
"Ottawa judge fears provincial decision"	139
"New youth act puts more in jail for longer terms"	139
<u>R. v. R.C.</u>	141
"Ontario court backlogs cited as factor in custody rulings"	145
B) Proof of Age	146
(i) Actual Age	147
(ii) Apparent Age	148
<u>R. v. Pilkington</u>	149
C) Minimum Age for Criminal Responsibility	153
Leschied and Wilson, "Criminal Liability of Children Under Twelve"	154
Peterson, "Children's Understanding of the Juvenile Justice System"	157
Group for the Advancement of Psychiatry, <u>How Old is Old Enough?</u>	169
"Law Courts Spawn Fagins, Officials Fear" <u>Child and Family Services Act</u>	171
	173
Chapter Three: Conduct Attracting a Legal Response	175
A) Offence Jurisdiction	175
B) Morality and Disposition Jurisdiction	176
Wadlington, <u>Children in the Legal System</u>	177
Dept. of Justice Committee, <u>Juvenile Delinquency in Canada</u>	180
"25% of alleged sex offenders under 18"	182
C) Pornography and Prostitution	183
Badgley, <u>Sexual Offences Against Children</u>	183
Fraser, <u>Pornography and Prostitution in Canada</u>	187
D) Truancy	199
<u>Re L.K.</u>	199
Leschied and Jaffee, "Implementing the Y.O.A. in Ontario"	202
Chapter Four: Extra-Judicial Responses	205
A) Formally Recognized Procedures (Alternative Measures)	205
(i) Introduction	205
(ii) Section 4 Y.O.A.	207
"Detaining the young"	209

<u>R. v. S.S.</u>	210
Bala and Lilles, <u>Young Offenders Act Annotated</u>	214
Moyer, "Diversion from the Juvenile Justice System"	215
<u>R. v. J.B.</u>	216
(iii) Effect of Alternative Measures on Young Offenders	218
Morton and West, <u>An Experiment in Diversion by a Citizen Committee</u>	219
 B) Informal Procedures	228
Chapter Five: The Juvenile Court Hearing	231
 A) Pre-Hearing Issues	231
(i) Applicable Procedure	232
"Brief of The Manitoba Society on Criminology"	233
(ii) Exclusive Jurisdiction of the Youth Court	234
(iii) Notice of Hearings	235
<u>R. v. L.</u>	236
<u>R. v. F.G.</u>	238
(iv) Arrest and Detention	239
(a) Rights Arising Upon Arrest and Detention	239
<u>R. v. James Michael G.</u>	240
<u>R. v. H.</u>	242
<u>R. v. Shannon H.</u>	244
<u>R. v. Ina Christina V.</u>	246
 (b) Temporary Restraint	249
(c) Judicial Interim Release	249
(d) Detention for Medical Reports	250
<u>R. v. D.S</u>	250
<u>R. v. J.M.</u>	251
(e) Pre-Trial Detention	254
(f) Availability of Detention Facilities	255
Department of Justice Committee on Juvenile	
Delinquency	255
<u>Re Jacey Ann B.</u>	256
"Ontario judge stresses importance of bail in young	
offender system"	258
 B) Adjudication	259
(i) Rights of the Young Person	259
(a) Right to Counsel	259
<u>R. v. Ronald H.</u>	260
"Use of criminal lawyers in youth courts assailed"	261
"Judges' stand"	262
"Judge's comments bring slap on wrist"	263
(ii) Special Considerations	264
(a) Privacy	264
<u>Southam Inc. v. The Queen</u>	266
Campbell, "Feathers in the Aquarium"	274
(b) Pleas	275
"Judge concerned guilty pleas unfair"	275
(c) Records	276
<u>Platt, Young Offenders Law in Canada</u>	278

Chapter Six: Transfer Proceedings	281
"Boy, 13, is found guilty of murdering 2 women"	283
A) Initiation of Proceedings	284
B) Factors Relevant to Transfer	285
<u>R. v. Mark Andrew Z.</u>	286
<u>R. v. W.S.</u>	294
"S.C.C. guidance for transfer to adult court"	297
"A truly offensive act"	300
Dept. of Justice - Bill C-58	301
Canadian Council on Children and Youth, "A Response to Bill C-58"	303
Besta and Wintemute, "Young offenders in adult court"	319
" Tough youth law misses the mark "	322
"Ont. teen's murder trial is transferred to adult court"	323
Chapter Seven: Issues of Race and Gender	324
A) First Nations Peoples	324
Report of the Race Relations and Policing Task Force	324
"Report on Marshall case finds racism widespread"	329
"In vindication of Donald Marshall"	330
"Group justice is no justice at all"	331
LaPrairie, "The Young Offenders Act and Aboriginal Youth"	332
Jackson, "Locking Up Natives"	339
Monture, "A Vicious Circle: Child Welfare and the First Nations"	341
Little, "Special Types of Young Offenders"	347
B) Police and Visible Minority Communities	352
"Police under fire"	352
Task Force Report	354
"Reforms in effect"	365
Bill 107	365
C) Delinquency and Gender	367
Langelier-Biron, "The Delinquent Young Girl: A Non-Entity"	367
Barnhorst, "Female Delinquency and the Role of Women"	378
Barnhorst, <u>Female Delinquency and the Juvenile Justice System</u>	385
Chapter Eight: Disposition of the Young Offender	387
A) Introduction	387
B) Procedure and Evidence	388
<u>R. v. Gardiner</u>	388
<u>R. v. R.I.</u>	390
Ontario Social Development Council	394
C) Dispositional Alternatives	395
(i) Discharges	397

(ii) Fines	399
(iii) Compensation, Restitution and Community Service Orders	400
<u>Bala and Lilles, Young Offenders Act Annotated</u>	401
Ontario Social Development Council	404
(iv) Prohibition	407
(v) Detention for Treatment	407
<u>Kittrie, The Right to be Different</u>	408
Family Court Clinic Brief	411
"Young Offenders Act 'almost anticalinical'"	413
(vi) Probation	415
Ontario Social Development Council	416
<u>R. v. T.L.</u>	419
(vii) Custody	421
<u>Blovin, "Disposition Hearing Strategy"</u>	422
<u>Re D.B. and The Queen</u>	426
<u>R. v. Gordon J.</u>	427
<u>R. v. B.D.</u>	428
Selected Statistics on Custody	430
Winterdyk and Roesch, "A Wilderness Experimental Program"	431
<u>R. v. R.I.</u>	434
<u>R. v. M.B.</u>	437
<u>R.R. v. R.</u>	440
<u>R. v. G.K.</u>	441
"Boy, 13, who killed two women gets maximum sentence"	442
(viii) Other Reasonable Conditions	444
(ix) Dispositions Not Included	445
 D) Determining Dispositions	446
(i) Assessment and Diagnosis: The Role of Professionals	446
(a) Section 13	446
<u>Bala and Lilles, The Young Offenders Act Annotated</u>	447
Awad and Chamberlain, "The Process of Psychiatric Work"	452
(b) Pre-Disposition Reports	457
Hanscom, The Dynamics of Disposition	462
(ii) Judicial Discretion	468
Hanscom, The Dynamics of Disposition	469
(iii) Treatment and its Effectiveness	480
Shamsie, "Anti-Social Adolescents: Our Treatments Do Not Work"	481
 Chapter Nine: The Role of the Lawyer, Prosecutor, Judge and Social Worker	488
 A) The Role of the Defence Lawyer	488
Law Society of Upper Canada Sub-Committee Report	491
Alexander, "Constitutional Rights in Juvenile Court"	492
Komar, "The Criminal Domestication of the Juvenile Delinquents Act"	493
Bogen, "Beating the Rap in Juvenile Court"	494
Isaacs, "The Role of the Lawyer Representing Minors"	497
Catton and Erickson, "The Juvenile's Perception of the Role of	

the Defence Counsel"	499
Hanscom, The Dynamics of Disposition	505
Peters, "Concrete Strategies for Managing Ethically-Based Conflicts"	513
Rules of Professional Conduct	517
 B) Capacity to Retain and Instruct Counsel	520
Leon, "Recent Developments in Legal Representation of Children"	520
<u>R. v. Wayne W.W.</u>	527
Law Society of Upper Canada Sub-Committee Report	528
 C) The Role of the Prosecutor	528
Grosman, "Young Offenders Before the Courts"	529
Fish, "Bill C-192: Another View"	530
<u>Boucher v. The Queen</u>	531
 D) The Role of the Judge	532
Bala, "Comment on <u>Smith v. Zeiger</u> "	533
The Royal Commission Inquiry into Civil Rights	536
MacAskill and Andrews, "The Role of the Youth Court Judge"	537

PART TWO

CHILDREN AS VICTIMS

Chapter Ten: The Abuse of Children	539
Underwood, "The Abuse of Children"	539
Chapter Eleven: Children as Witnesses	543
 A) Reliability of Children's Evidence	543
Bessner, "The Competency of the Child Witness"	543
Yuille, "The Systematic Assessment of Children's Testimony"	555
Goodman, "Children's Testimony in Historical Perspective"	563
Amiel, "A questionable witness to abuse"	566
Gelman, "The Sex-Abuse Puzzle"	567
Makin, "Listening to the Children" . . .	569
 B) A Less Intimidating Environment	571
Bala, "Double Victims: Child Sexual Abuse"	571
Stewart and Bala, "Understanding Criminal Prosecutions for Child Sexual Abuse"	588
<u>Coy v. Iowa</u>	593
<u>R. v. Levogiannis</u>	601
<u>R. v. Thompson</u>	605
 C) Expert Evidence	611
Vogl and Bala, "Testifying on Behalf of Children"	611
<u>R. v. F.E.J.</u>	615
 D) Innovative Programs to Assist Child Witnesses	619
Jaffe et al., "Court Testimony of Child Sexual Abuse Victims"	619
Court Ordeals For Children: A Need For Innovative Programs	623